



A בס"ד
Today we will learn מג דף of סוכה בע"ה

The topics we will learn about include the following:

Details about the מצות of לולב and ערבה when certain days of יום טוב fall on שבת

When these מצות override the prohibitions of שבת

A
ערבה and לולב
יום טוב when certain days of
fall on שבת

When these מצות
override שבת

B How we know when we are obligated in the מצות of סוכה and לולב

How the ערבה of מצוה was done during the times of the בהמ"ק

B
How we know
when
we are obligated
in סוכה and לולב

How the ערבה was done
during the times of the בהמ"ק

C Some of the key terms and concepts we will learn about include:

גזירה דרבה - The decree of רבה.

רבה decreed that certain מצות are not done on שבת because fulfilling them may lead to violating the שבת.

קיבועא דירחא - Establishing the new month. In earlier times, the beginning of a new month was determined by witnesses who saw the new moon. Messengers would travel to various locations informing Jews outside of ארץ ישראל that the new month had started. They would need to reach these areas before the 15th of the month so that people would know when פסח and סוכות should be celebrated. Sometimes the messengers didn't reach these cities in time so the people in the farther away cities just assumed the previous month was 29 days and they would celebrate יום טוב for two days just in case. In ארץ ישראל there was no uncertainty so they knew exactly when יום טוב should be celebrated.

מכשירי לולב - Things done to prepare the לולב for the מצוה such as cutting it off the tree and binding it with the other species.

בייתוסין - The Baytusin. These were followers of the heretic צדוקי who were members of the בייתוס who did not accept the authority of the Rabbis or the validity of the Oral Law.

C
גזירה דרבה
קיבועא דירחא
מכשירי לולב
בייתוסין

Review



1 So let's review...

The גמרא begins by questioning the law set forth in the משנה that if שבת falls out on one of the final six days of סוכות, the לולב is not taken on that day in the בהמ"ק.

אמאי טלטול בעלמא הוא ולידחי שבת
The only reason the לולב would be forbidden to be taken on that day is because of מוקצה - but that is only אסור מדרבנן - shouldn't the Torah commandment of לולב override that?

1 If שבת falls out on one of the final 6 days of סוכות, the לולב is not taken on that day in the בהמ"ק



אמאי טלטול בעלמא הוא ולידחי שבת?

2 רבה answers, that indeed the reason it is forbidden is not because of מוקצה but rather because...

גזרה שמא יטלנו בידו וילך אצל בקי ללמוד ויעבירונו ארבע אמות ברשות הרבים
there is a decree against this because maybe someone will take his לולב to an expert to learn how to shake it and will inadvertently carry it four amos in the public domain which would be a Biblical transgression.

והיינו טעמא דשופר והיינו טעמא דמגילה
The גמרא then adds that this is also reason we don't blow שופר or read the מגילה on שבת.

2 גזרה שמא יטלנו בידו וילך אצל בקי ללמוד ויעבירונו ארבע אמות ברשות הרבים

ופיינו טעמא דשופר ופיינו טעמא דמגילה

3 The גמרא then goes on to discuss why on the first day of Succos they would take the Lulov in the בהמ"ק even if it came out on Shabbos - and concludes - אלא ראשון דאיתיה מן התורה - since the first day we are obligated to take the Lulov מן התורה everywhere, even outside the בהמ"ק, therefore the רבנן did not impose their גזירה.

אי הכי האידנא נמי
If so, asks the גמרא, even today we who live outside of ארץ ישראל should be able take the לולב when the first day of סוכות falls on שבת.

3 Why... On the first day of Succos they would take the Lulov in the בהמ"ק even if it came out on Shabbos

אלא ראשון דאיתיה מן התורה בגבולין לא גזרו בהו



אי הכי האידנא נמי?

4 The Gemara answers דירחא בקיבועא דירחא גמרא, we don't really know exactly when the new month actually begins, therefore we cannot override שבת for the sake of the מצוה of לולב on that day. On the other hand in ארץ ישראל where they know when the new month begins they do need to take the לולב even when the first day is שבת.

4

אנן לא ידעינן
בקיבועא דירחא

On the other hand in ארץ ישראל they know when the new month begins

5 The Gemara then begins to discuss the source that outside of the בהמ"ק, the מצוה of לולב is התורה מן only on the first day.

דתניא - ולקחתם לכם ביום הראשון
The possuk says: and you will take for yourselves on the first day.
ולקחתם - 'and you should take' teaches - שתהא לקיחה ביד כל אחד ואחד - that everyone is obligated to do this mitzvah.
לכם, 'to you' teaches - משלכם - that it must belong to you
ביום, 'on the day' teaches that you should take them even on שבת when it is the first day.
ראשון, 'first' means you take the לולב on the first day even outside of the בהמ"ק.
הראשון 'the' teaches that only on the first day does לולב overrides שבת.
The Gemara analyzes this ברייתא further.

5

The source...
בהמ"ק
Outside the מן התורה
is לולב only on the first day

דמניא

שתהא לקיחה ביד כל אחד ואחד (ולקחתם לכם) משלכם

Even on שבת when it's the first day (ביום) הראשון

Take the לולב on the first day outside of the בהמ"ק

Only on the 1st day does לולב overrides שבת

6 Why do we need a פסוק to permit taking the לולב on שבת?

מכדי טלטול בעלמא הוא
- איסור דרבנן which is only an muktzeh

6

Why do we need a פסוק to permit taking the לולב on שבת?
מכדי טלטול בעלמא הוא?

7 אמר רבא לא נצרכא אלא למכשירי לולב
 מכשירי לולב answers that the פסוק is needed to permit לולב things
 that are done to prepare the לולב which might be התורה

This answer goes according to the opinion of ר' אליעזר who holds that לולב and all things that are done to prepare the לולב override שבת because the word ביום from the possuk of ביום הראשון teaches that everything needed for this מצוה may be done on this day even if it falls on שבת.

The רבנן however hold that ביום teaches that the מצוה must be done during the day and not at night.

ר' אליעזר on the other hand learns this out from the end of that possuk -
 ושמחתם לפני ה' אלקיכם שבעת ימים,
 you should celebrate before Hashem for seven days - "ימים"
 days, not nights.

The רבנן say that learning from that part of the פסוק might make us think we compare the word ימים in this context to the ימים in the context of the מצוה of סוכה which says
 בסכת תשבו ושבעת ימים -
 and just like that מצוה is also done at night, so too לולב is also at night.

8 וסוכה גופה מנלן
 The גמרא goes on to discuss how we know that the מצוה of סוכה is also at night.
 דתנו רבנן
 סוכות תשבו ושבעת ימים, for seven days you shall dwell in סוכות.
 The word "ימים" implies the nights as well.

9 The גמרא then presents two other places in the תורה where the word ימים appears. It appears in the context of לולב and in the context of the מילואים, the inauguration of אהרן and his sons as כהנים. If we compare it to לולב, which is only done during the day, then סוכה is only a daytime מצוה. If we compare it to the מילואים, which required the כהנים to stay by the משכן for seven days and nights, dwelling in the סוכה would be required during the day and night. The גמרא is unsure which is the more logical comparison. On one hand it would seem that we should compare שמצותו כל היום מדבר שמצותו כל היום, in other words סוכה which is done all day to the מילואים which required the כהנים to spend all day at the משכן but not to לולב which - as you lift it up, the מצוה is completed. On the other hand it would seem that we should compare, לדבר שמצותו לדורות מדבר שמצותו לדורות, in other words סוכה, which is a מצוה that applies forever, to לולב which also applies forever and not to the מילואים, which were only for that initial inauguration.



8

וסוכה גופה מנלן?

How we know סוכה is also at night



10 The Gemara concludes that we really know this from a גזירה שוה between סוכות and מילואים. As it says the word תשבו in both places. Just like the כהנים dwelled at the משכן day and night, so too the מצוה of סוכה is during the day and night.

10

The גמרא concludes...

We really know this from a גזירה שוה...

| | |
|---------------|---------------|
| מילואים | סוכות |
| תשבו | תשבו |
| Day and night | Day and night |

(Note: In the original image, a red arrow points from the Hebrew 'תשבו' in the Succot column to the Hebrew 'תשבו' in the Miluim column, and a red circle highlights the Succot 'תשבו'.)

11 The Gemara then begins to discuss the מצוה of ערבה which was performed all seven days of succos - and that it overrides שבת if the seventh day fell on שבת.

The gemora asks...
ערבה בשביעי מ"ט דחיא שבת
א"ר יוחנן כדי לפרסמה שהיא מן התורה
מן התורה ר' יוחנן says it overrides שבת to show that it is התורה.

11

ערבה

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Performed all seven days | Overrides שבת if the seventh day fell on שבת |
|--------------------------|--|

?

ערבה בשביעי מ"ט דחיא שבת?

א"ר יוחנן

כדי לפרסמה שהיא מן התורה

12 Although this reason should apply to לולב as well, the גמרא explains we don't take the לולב all seven days דרבה because of רבה's decree that one might carry it in the street.

12

?

Although this reason should apply to לולב as well?

גזרה משום דרבה

One might carry it in the street

13 Although this decree should really apply to the ערבה as well, the גמרא says that since only שלוחי בית דין מייתי לה בהמ"ק, agents of the court bring them to the בהמ"ק, we are not concerned that they will violate שבת. However, לולב לכל מסור, everyone has their own לולב and there is a greater chance that someone might violate שבת.

13 This decree should apply to the ערבה as well?

Since only שלוחי בית דין מייתי לה we are not concerned that they will violate שבת
 However, לולב לכל מסור

14 אי הכי כל יומא נמי לידחי
 If so - the ערבה ceremony should override שבת no matter which day of the יום טוב is שבת, not just when it's the seventh day. The גמרא answers that if the ערבה ceremony was permitted on any day that שבת fell out on, people would treat לולב with less honor because it only overrides שבת on the first day of יום טוב.

14 אי הכי כל יומא נמי לידחי?

If the ערבה ceremony was permitted on any day that שבת fell out on אתי לפקפוקי בלולב

15 ולידחי ביום טוב ראשון
 So why does ערבה not override שבת on the first day just like לולב?

15 ולידחי ביום טוב ראשון?
 שבת ערבה not override on the first day just like לולב?

The גמרא answers - that the רבנן were concerned that people might say that we only override שבת for לולב which is a מצות עשה מן התורה but not for ערבה. Since the מצוה of ערבה is not explicitly stated in the Torah, some - the Beissoosim - who did not accept the words of the חכמים - looked to belittle this mitzvah - therefore the חכמים looked to strengthen it and decreed that the ערבה should have an independent day where it could be דוחה שבת. The seventh day was chosen so as to set apart from the other days since it's the end of יום טוב.

People might say we only override שבת for לולב which is a מצות עשה מן התורה but not for ערבה which is not explicitly stated in the Torah



16 Although, as we learned earlier, there is no concern that the ערבה might be carried in the Public Domain, we still don't do ערבה on Shabbos, since the Destruction, because אנן לא ידעינן בקיבועא דירחא and we cannot override שבת.

16

Although,
there is no concern that the ערבה
might be carried in the Public Domain...

We don't do ערבה on Shabbos,
since the Destruction,
because
אנן לא ידעינן
בקיבועא דירחא

17 In ארץ ישראל however they would be able to perform the ערבה ceremony on שבת - but, as בר הדיא said, לא איקלע - the seventh day never falls on שבת due to calender calculations. However, רבין and other who came to בבל from ארץ ישראל said, דחי ולא דחי - that the seventh day could fall on שבת but the ערבה ceremony does not override it.

17

In ארץ ישראל however...

| | |
|--|---|
| בר הדיא said, לא איקלע The 7th day NEVER falls on שבת | רבין and other who came to בבל from ארץ ישראל said, איקלע ולא דחי The 7th day COULD fall on שבת but ערבה does not override it |
|--|---|

18 ואלא קשיא
If so - that the חכמים looked to strengthen the mitzvah of ערבה - then why shouldn't the ערבה be שבת in ארץ ישראל

18

ואלא קשיא?

מאן לימא לן דערבה בנשילה
דלמא בזקיפה
Maybe אמר רב יוסף was to place them
upright around the מצבה

אמר רב יוסף - מאן לימא לן דערבה בנשילה דלמא בזקיפה
רב יוסף answers that we don't do the ceremony since the Destruction, because, maybe the actual מצוה was not to walk around with the ערבה - but rather to just place the branches upright around the מצבה. And since there is no מצוה today, the ceremony doesn't override שבת.



19 רב יוסף challenges אביי that the משנה taught לולב and ערבה in the same phrase to teach us that אף ערבה בנטילה is done by taking, ערבה is the same way.

19

רב יוסף challenges אביי

The לולב & ערבה taught משנה in the same phrase to teach us

מה לולב בנטילה אף ערבה בנטילה

20 רב יוסף does not accept this proof plus numerous others that Abaya posses against him

20

רב יוסף does not accept this proof plus numerous others that Abaya posses against him...

21 however at the conclusion of this discussion Abaya finally presents ברייתא that refutes רב יוסף The ברייתא teaches that פעם אחת חל שביעי של ערבה להיות בשבת - one time when the seventh day of יום טוב fell out on שבת - the ביייתוסין came into the Courtyard of the Temple and hid the ערבות that had brought there before שבת, under some rocks. עמי הארץ, some ignorant people, retrieved them from under the rocks and the כהנים brought them and stood them up around the מזבח. The ברייתא explained that the שאין ביייתוסין מודים שחיבוט ערבה דוחה, they did not believe that waving the ערבה overrides שבת.

21

ברייתא finally presents that refutes רב יוסף

פעם אחת חל שביעי של ערבה להיות בשבת

The ערבות hid the ערבות under some rocks... retrieved them...

The ברייתא explained...

שאין ביייתוסין מודים שחיבוט ערבה דוחה את השבת

The גמרא says that since waving was mentioned, we see from here they would indeed first take the ערבות in their hand and then they would stand them up around the מזבח.

The גמרא concludes that this is a solid refutation of רב יוסף and the מצוה of ערבה was the taking of the ערבה, not standing them up around the מזבח.
